

## **Post Tenure Review Pilot**

### **Second Year Summary of Faculty Accomplishments and Pilot Recommendations**

Per the written pilot proposal, the Post Tenure Review summary document will be prepared “for both faculty and administration” and will summarize “faculty accomplishments for the purposes of celebrating, creating collaborative opportunities, and enhancing the development of faculty to meet their professional interests and needs.” The information below represents that summary. It comes from the written narratives submitted by faculty members and is supplemented where indicated by data gathered from a survey administered after the Spring Scholarship Celebration to the volunteer participants in the pilot. This year, it concludes with recommendations for the ongoing administration of this program.

#### **A Recap of the Process:**

Tenured professors who volunteered for this first pilot year submitted:

- An updated CV
- A narrative describing the goals achieved or anticipated since the last review. This could include the criterion utilized for promotion and tenure decisions, which include: teaching effectiveness, professional development, faculty administration, service/presence within NDNU, and engagement with NDNU’s Mission, including inclusive excellence.
- A reflection on the support needed or ideas related to enhancing professional development

Each of the six who participated this second year also participated in a mini-conference on campus, which we called the Spring Scholarship Celebration. At this, the participants presented some element of their work in short presentations.

#### **Highlights from the Narratives Submitted**

Each narrative addressed the different elements assessed in the tenure process, with a priority on teaching effectiveness. A beautiful introduction to this section came from one narrative, in which one participant reflects on the value of a university education. This individual says that, “In the fall of 1963 [James] Baldwin spoke to a group of New York City schoolteachers about the perils the nation faced and the obligations of educators. “*The purpose of education,*” he observed, is

*“to create in a person the ability to look at the world for himself, to make his own decisions, to say to himself this is black or this is white, to decide for himself whether there is a God in heaven or not. To ask questions of the universe, and then learn to live with those questions, is the way he achieves his own identity. But no society is really anxious to have that kind of person around. What societies really, ideally, want is a citizenry which will simply obey the rules of society. If a society succeeds in this, that society is about to perish. The obligation of anyone who thinks of himself as responsible*

*is to examine society and try to change it and to fight it – at no matter what risk. This is the only hope society has. This is the only way societies change”*

(“A Talk to Teachers,” *Saturday Review*, Dec. 21, 1963, p. 42). Our presenting professor reflected that upon arrival at NDNU, ***“I found that the courage and imagination that animated Baldwin and all those other brave souls who fought for a better world through education and other means were alive and well. I felt privileged to be a part of it – a small campus that nonetheless felt expansive, cosmopolitan, intimately connected to the broader world.”*** This reflection captures admirably the passion for teaching that each faculty member expressed in different ways, highlighting the most important element of their work.

Note that the following bullets are general categories only; for example, in just one example, a participating faculty member noted that since receiving tenure, that individual has had three publications; 17 scholarly presentations, locally and nationally; teaching and training at least five extensive courses from three diverse groups of ... professionals within the community; an active ...private practice ...; editing over 80 publications while serving as the Reviews Editor; serving on 11 doctoral dissertation committees; participating in one documentary film; and ongoing community engagement work..., which has served over 300 women, including underserved populations, since 2012. Each of those presenting their work had a similar scope of impressive accomplishments.

Other highlights in the various tenure categories include:

- Multiple impressive teaching awards, both within and external to NDNU.
- Innovative courses developed; student evaluations included.
- Testimonies were provided from graduates about the effectiveness of teaching and its effect on their careers and/or graduate work.
- Publications (writing and editing) in various journals and books, including *Jung Journal: Culture and Psyche*, art catalogs for the Wiegand Gallery and for other independent art publications, chapters in a history of psychology textbook and a new edition of their St. Clair “Object Relations and Self-Psychology: An Introduction,” Book review editor of *Peace Review: A Journal of Social Justice*, a quarterly that defines peace research broadly to include peace, human rights, development, ecology, culture, and related issues; Producing a global learning community of interest (COIN) facilitating the practice of using collaborative business technology for developing Business Agility Readiness (BAR) based on my ground-breaking new book, *Creating Business Agility: How Convergence of Cloud, Social, Mobile, Video, and Big Data Enables Competitive Advantage* recently published by Wiley; and more.
- Web sites developed
- Community work, such as: spearheading a variety of programs ... including the Tis the Season Campaign which raised money to support Aim High and Edventure More for

underserved children; developed and sponsored Professional Development Day where we included the *Empowering Girls Group* with the San Mateo County Sheriff's League; and the *Ever Forward Club*, developed by Ashanti Branch, community leader and activist, who promotes higher education and opportunities for underserved and at risk children, formal partnerships with school districts and documented accomplishments that stemmed from those,

- Professional presentations at numerous conferences
- Multiple moderators and panel presentations on and off campus.
- Involvement on numerous NDNU committees and contributions on each.
- Multiple contributions to on-campus colloquiums.
- Development of part time faculty, formal and informal mentoring of faculty.
- Strong statements about teaching effectiveness and reflections on ways that faculty have sought new and innovative methods to motivate students and engage them in the learning process.
- Involvement with student and alumni groups.
- Membership and involvement in various professional associations.
- Administrative contributions to the support of programs.
- Innumerable examples of service to NDNU/campus presence.
- Strong statements about Mission, Values and Inclusive Excellence supported by examples of specific actions taken to support programs and individuals.
- Current research includes:
  - A book-length study of Margaret Anderson, the founder of the pioneering Modernist journal, *The Little Review*.
  - Conducting research & development of Cloud technology to enable personal Lifelong Learning experiences based on ROLE technology using self-regulated learning pedagogy.
  - A joint conference with a colleague at California Institute of Integral Studies entitled, *Inspired Educators in a Secular Age: Spirituality in Higher Education*.
  - A two-person exhibition with ... the painter Deborah Kirklin, this February at the Jennifer Perlmutter Gallery.

*Conclusion:* The breadth and scope of the professional accomplishments submitted for consideration impressed all members of the Faculty Development committee. Many of these are collected, in more specific form, in the annual list of faculty accomplishments published on our web page.

**Suggestions and Issues Related to Professional Development** (from narratives and post-SSC survey): Faculty reflected on the change in the student population and how that affects faculty workloads, noting that students require more attention than even a few years ago. Resources that faculty requested included more financial resources for research (research assistance, administrative support, technology, and travel) and time.

### **Specific Feedback about Post-Tenure Review Pilot:**

As noted in last year's overview, faculty appreciated the opportunity to reflect through their narratives. The Spring Scholarship Celebration was likewise a positive opportunity; recommendations include keeping the presentations flexible to allow faculty to present as needed, but to limit participation so that more conversation about each topic is encouraged. Others have added:

- Thank you for your commitment to the faculty and to all of our learning and scholarship.
- I felt very supported going through post-tenure and celebrating the work that we all have done.

### **Pilot Conclusion and Recommendations:**

This concludes a two year pilot that was formulated in response to a BOT request to initiate such a project; feedback from faculty and administrators before, during, and after the pilot; and participation by over a dozen faculty members. As a result of the success of this pilot, we present the following recommendations:

1. Continue the Post Tenure Review Process as an annual event
2. Make participation mandatory to all tenured faculty who have been tenured more than five years.
3. Continue the requirements as stated above (reflection, updated CV, and presentation).

*Discussion:* Concern has been expressed by the Provost that the Post Tenure Review process does not allow for corrective action in the way that it is utilized in other institutions. Indeed, based on the examples provided of the types of situations in which corrective action may be required (i.e. mental illness, inappropriate behavior, nonperformance, student complaints), this process would not address that objective. However, rather than altering the Post Tenure Review process, which would compromise its strengths and purpose, we propose that the faculty handbook's existing language be considered for updates to ensure that it describes appropriate procedures for intervention in the case of such potential faculty issues.

Despite utilizing a structure that would be inadequate to address more extreme and unusual issues of faculty behavior, were they to occur, this process has successfully created a unique and important venue for faculty to share their work, celebrate accomplishments together, reflect on progress, and assess resources needed for ongoing work. Many participants initially grumbled about the required narratives, but all remarked positively on the value of taking the time to assess their work in a holistic way and to reflect with other faculty members on ongoing and future plans. For many years, faculty morale has been a serious concern on the NDNU campus; this process has built community across disciplines and across schools despite other stressors. It thus serves a vital purpose and an important need and should be continued and supported.